

THE TRUTH IS SYNTHETIC: DOGMATICS AS SYNTHESIS

*Angelo Luciani Moa Dosi WODA**

Abstract:

Pemahaman ajaran Gereja Universal mengenai keabadian jiwa, api penyucian, surga, dan neraka bukan hanya berkaitan tentang hal-hal yang terjadi pada akhir jaman. Bukan pula upaya mengelaborasi cabang teologi sistematika terakhir yang disebut eskatologi. Melainkan, upaya memahami ajaran iman Kristiani sejak permulaannya hingga keselamatan yang definitif pada hidup yang akan datang. Itu berarti melihat kesatuan teologi dalam misteri keselamatan Allah melalui peristiwa Yesus Kristus dan kuasa Roh Kudus yang hadir dalam Gereja kepada seluruh umat manusia. Itulah sebabnya, ajaran iman Gereja universal mengenai misteri hidup yang kekal bukanlah suatu utopia, khayalan, atau impian belaka, melainkan suatu realitas hidup yang bersumber dari misteri Allah Tritunggal, Yesus Kristus, dan Gereja universal.

Keywords:

The principle and bipolarity of both-and (et-et), eschatology, living reality, the resurrection, the immortality of the souls, the *parousia* of Christ, purgatory, heaven, and hell.

Introduction

The discussion regarding eschatology does not only elaborate the last things because nowadays eschatology has become the heart of theology. Thus, eschatology is interpreted in the perspective of Anthropology,

Trinity, Christology, Pneumatology, and Ecclesiology.¹ That is why the paper will be based on the text of Fr. M. Gagliardi's book. I also developed the paper from another sources. I will try to apply **the principle of et-et (the both-and)** in the treatise of eschatology. For this reason, this paper will be developed in the following themes, that is *The Basic Understanding of Eschatology, the Destiny of Human Being after Death, Christ will Come Again to Judge the Living and the Dead, and the Purgatory, Heaven, and Hell.*

The Basic Understanding of Eschatology

PREDESTINATION AND HUMAN FREEDOM

The basic of understanding of eschatology deals with **the et-et principle**, namely, the relation of *both predestination and human freedom*. Predestination indicated God's plan for human being, world, and the universe. This means before eternity God had a unique design for all His creatures. In doing so, God predestined His works through the Incarnation of His beloved son, our Lord Jesus Christ in the Holy Spirit (Cf. Ef 1, 3-12 and Rm 8, 28-30). Thus, *predestination is tied up with divine pre-science* (this also **the et-et bipolarity**). Divine pre-science refers to the omnipotent and the immutability of God's knowledge to all created beings. Thus, God knows every aspect to His creation. However, this does not mean that God creates all being for eternal damnation. Conversely, God willed all creation to be saved. Indeed, God want to save all people without exception. For this reason, the Catholic Church rejects the false conception of predestination, namely, double predestination. This thought was declared by Calvin who stated that God predestined all men in twofold, that is for eternal salvation or eternal damnation without the capacity of human freedom. The deterministic idea was condemned at the Council of Arles (473), the Council of Orange II (529), and the Council of Trent (1545-63). *Saint Thomas Aquinas underlined how it was important to comprehend that what was predestined by God in eternity, it is actualized in the present through the response of the human freedom.*²

* **Angelo Luciani Moa Dosi WODA** adalah alumnus dari Universitas Pontifikal St. Thomas Aquinas, Roma 2018.

¹ P. C. PHAN, "Roman Catholic Theology" in Jerry L. WALLS (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Eschatology*, Oxford University Press, New York (NY) 2008, 215-220; Joseph RATZINGER, *Eschatology: Death and Eternal Life*, second edition, translated by M. WALDSTEIN and edited by A. NICHOLS, The Catholic University of America Press, Washington, D.C. 1988, 1-4.

² *Summa Theologica (ST)*, I, q. 23, a. 6.

THE METAPHOR AND REALITY

As mentioned above, God's predestination will take effect historically in the order of human freedom. But, the problem is how can we penetrate the mystery of Christian faith in the reality since the great mystery of Christian faith is the Trinity in the relation with the Incarnation of the Word? The mystery of faith disclosed the redemption and salvation of Triune God in Jesus Christ for all people of God. However, there are still many things remain hidden. A question will arise, what happens after life?

Answering the problem, we will focus on the divine person of Jesus Christ. Christian faith confessed Jesus Christ is the Son of the living God who comes from the Father for our salvation (*cf.* John 3,13). As Jesus ascended into heaven, in the same way Jesus will come again (*Cf.* Acts 1: 9-11). These texts pointed out since Jesus Christ comes from above and He already knew what happened in eternity. *By the virtue of the Incarnation, Jesus unveils all hidden mysteries in human beings and world history. If previously the mystery was recognized as myth, symbol, or tale, but through Jesus, all things become a living reality.*³ Here we found **the et-et principle** that is the relation of both metaphor and reality.

Cardinal Joseph Ratzinger (Pope Benedict XVI) deepened these approaches. He maintained Jesus' proclamation of the Kingdom of God. It starts at the beginning and becomes the key of Jesus' ministry: *"The time is fulfilled and the Kingdom of God as at hand: repent and believe in the Gospel"* (Mk 1: 15). Jesus' preaching of the Kingdom of God ties up with "His cross and resurrection" (*cf.* Mt 12, 38-42 *par*). It reveals in one side the grace and eschatology and in other side, the grace and repentance.

The way of entering the kingdom of God is through repentance. Repentance signifies a grace offered by God and received by men. This is clear when Jesus said: *"if it is by the finger of God that I cast out demons then the Kingdom of God has come upon you"* (Lk 11, 20). So, through the life and ministry of Jesus, the power of the Holy Spirit liberates all men from all evils and sins. Thus, in the person of Jesus Christ, the reign of God's Kingdom becomes the living reality.⁴

³ M. GAGLIARDI, *La Verità è Sintetica: Teologia Dogmatica Cattolica*, Cantagalli, Siena 2017, 801-803.

⁴ Joseph RATZINGER, *op. cit.*, 29-35.

THE PRESENT AND THE FUTURE LIFE

The realization of God's Kingdom disclosed the treatise of eschatology belongs to *both the future (alibi et nunc) and the present (hic et nunc)*. This is **the both-and bipolarity**. Eschatology is not only longer dealing with the world beyond space and time, but it is referring to the present. So, eschatology is no longer an abstract theology but rather it becomes a concrete theology. In this perspective, eschatology is reflected in the criteria of Christology. The mystery of Jesus Christ irradiates all the future that is actualized in the present, here and now.⁵

The problem is how can we penetrate between the future and the present? Responding this question, I would trace back to J. Ratzinger's theological reflection. According to him, we shall interpret Matthew 24, Mark 13, and Luke 21 in the context of eschatology. *First*, he pointed out that the fall of Jerusalem was assumed as the end of the world (Mt 24, 15-22; Mk 13, 14-20, Lk 21, 20-23, Cf. Dn 12, 11). *Second*, the frightfulness of the final tribulation (*see* Mt 24, 22 and Mk 13, 20). *At last*, it was linked with the coming of the Son of God and of the Son of Man (Mt 24, 29-31; Mk 13, 24-27; and Lk 21, 25-28).

By seeing the trio of the texts as a whole, the fall of Jerusalem was not the end or the destruction of the world, but indeed, the beginning of the salvation for the world by God. The understanding of those texts does not mean in a way of retrospect, but by grasping the history of the world becomes its reality. The continuation of the schema and reality is the fundamental form for Christian faith. This means the unity of the Word in the Old Testament and the reality of New Testament. In other words, the history of the world was reflected, anticipated and finds its reality in the crucified and risen Christ. That is the reason why, Ratzinger pointed out **the et-et principle** of both *the present and future life* as follows:

Jesus proclaimed the good news of the Kingdom of God as a reality which is both present and still to come. The Early Church knew itself to be faithful to this original message by proclaiming Jesus as the Christ, as He who acts in the Spirit, and so constitutes the present form of the Kingdom. By gazing on the Risen Christ, Christianity knew that a most significant coming had already taken place. It no longer proclaimed a pure theology of hope, living from mere expectation of the future, but pointed to a "now" in which the promise had already become presence. Such a present was, of course, itself hope, for it bears the future within itself.⁶

⁵ M. GAGLIARDI, *op. cit.*, 803-805.

⁶ Joseph RATZINGER, *op.cit.*, 35-45.

The Destiny of Human Being after Death

THE RESURRECTION OF CHRIST AND OUR RESURRECTION

After dealing with the approach of eschatology, we arrived at the fundamental question regarding the destiny of human being after death. If Christian anthropology stated human being as *the unity of both body and soul*, why there is separation between the body and soul after death? Replying those questions, M. Gagliardi stated **the both-and principle** as follows, “though after death the body will decay, the souls still have a space since from the beginning they were creatures. Then, after death, the souls will wait until their unification with glorified body. As we believed in Christian faith *both Jesus and Mary* ascended into heaven with *their body and soul*.”⁷

At this point, I will discuss **the et-et bipolarity**, namely, *the Resurrection of Christ and our resurrection*. J. Ratzinger unfolded both resurrection as a single reality. With two texts of Pauline letters, namely, Roman 6 and the First Corinthians 15, he elaborated both terms. At the heart of Roman 6, 1-14, the apostle of Saint Paul revealed the meaning of baptism. The baptism is not only dealing with a new life of Christ, but indeed, all Christians participate *in the life, death, and in the hope of Christ's resurrection*. In this sense, the questions of the Sadducees to Jesus regarding the resurrection of death in Mark 12 finds its meaning. In the line of the First Corinthians 15, the resurrection of Christ had already happened (*see 2 Tm 2, 18*). All the disciple of Christ by receiving *the Body and Blood of Christ* (cf. Jn 6) will have “*the resurrection and eternal life*” (Jn 11). Thus, the resurrection of Christ becomes the cause of our resurrection.⁸

The realism of both resurrection as a single reality were being developed in the patristic time. At the time, the profession of faith on resurrection became the formula of old Roman Creed, namely, the resurrection of faith. In the Eleventh Council of Toledo (675), the doctrine was more deepened in a fully reflective way. By avoiding spiritualizing on the resurrection and hinder the influence of Gnosticism, the Fathers of the Council found a better theological expression. There was no contradiction between the Resurrection of Christ and our own resurrection. Indeed, by the virtue of Christ's resurrection, we will have the glorified body with the

⁷ M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 810-811.

⁸ Joseph RATZINGER, *op.cit.*, 114-119.

same body as we live on the earth. There is transformation from earthly body to the risen body on the last days.⁹

INTERMEDIATE STATE BETWEEN DEATH AND RESURRECTION

The hope of the resurrection in Christ brings us to a new perspective concerning the question of the separated souls from the bodies, where will the souls go after the death? Answering this problem, Catechism of Catholic Church declared: “*in death, the separation of the soul from the body, the human body decays and the soul goes meet God, while awaiting its reunion with its glorified body.*”¹⁰ This means when the time comes, God will grant the reunification the glorified body with the soul by the virtue of Christ’s resurrection.

Until the reunion of the souls with glorified bodies occurs, what happened with the separated souls? During the state between death and resurrection it could be called the intermediate state. It was necessary tracing back the early Judaism in order to find its continuity with the early Christians. The development from Hebrew to Greek’s culture in various sources, such as the book of Enoch, Ezra, and those in Qumran remarked the departed souls go to what is called the *Sheol*. In that state, the souls will be divided into the just soul and the unjust soul. The just soul will be granted Heaven and the unjust will be punished at the *gehenna*, the place of damnation.

At the time of Jesus and the apostles, there was already the idea of an intermediate state. This term refers to the story of Lazarus in Abraham’s bosom (Lk 16, 19-31) and the crucified Christ who accepted the prayer of the good thief: “*Truly, I say to you, today you will be with me in Paradise*” (Lk 23, 43). This verse is linked with Stephen’s martyrdom: “*Lord Jesus, receive my spirit*” (Acts 7, 59). Then, the Apostle of Saint Paul stated that after death, we will meet God (1 Thes 4, 16; Phil 1, 23). Through Christ, God will provide “a place” for all of us (2 Cor 5, 10). In sum, through Jesus the souls after death will immediately go to God.¹¹ That is the reason why, the Catechism of Catholic Church maintained that at the moment of death, the souls will be faced by a particular judgement. It is stated as follows: “*Each man receives his eternal retribution in his immortal soul at the very moment of his death, in a particular judgment that refers his life to Christ:*

⁹ M. SHARKEY – T. WEINANDY (eds.), *International Theological Commission: Text and Documents 1986-2007*, vol. II, Ignatius Press, San Francisco 2009, 61-62.

¹⁰ *Catechism of the Catholic Church (CCC)*, 997.

¹¹ Joseph RATZINGER, *op.cit.*, 120-129.

either entrance into the blessedness of heaven – through a purification or immediately, - or immediate and everlasting damnation.”¹²

THE EXISTENCE AND THE IMMORTALITY OF THE SOULS

There was a still another problem regarding the separated soul from the body. As already mentioned, the souls after death still has relationship with the body since that is what it conforms the whole human being. As regard with the human being, philosophy only admitted the unity of both human and body and its reciprocal relation in earthly life. Philosophy had a limit to elaborate *the composite body and soul after life*. Through anthropology and christology, the separated souls have *the character and existence of immortality*. Another question arises, how can we understand the immortality of the souls?¹³

Responding this question, Saint Thomas Aquinas deepened **the both-and bipolarity**, *namely, the unity and relation* of both body and soul, which emphasized “the soul as the form of the body (*anima forma corporis*).”¹⁴ In this sense, there is no separation between body and soul. Conversely, the unity and relation of both body and soul constitutes the self consciousness and distinction of acting subject. That is why in the reality, the unity of both body and soul in human being does not point to something or an object, but indeed, the composite body and human soul reveals to *who, a human person*, and nothing else. Thus, *the relation is unique, dynamic, and consistent*.¹⁵

J. Ratzinger continued this theological reflection. For him, Saint Thomas Aquinas’ formula, namely, the soul is the form of the body becomes the hermeneutical key for understanding the concept of human person. Consequently, it opens up to the meaning of the immortality of the soul. That is why the Council of Vienne on May 6, 1312 underlined the concept of soul as appropriate to Christian faith. Furthermore, as regard with the soul, the soul does not only belong to the world, but the soul will come meet God. From the creation, the souls as the form of body had relationship with God. Through its relationship with God, Saint Thomas Aquinas’ formula, that is *anima forma corporis* shares in the mystery of Christ, especially in the living and dying of Christ.¹⁶

¹² CCC, 1022.

¹³ M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 811-812.

¹⁴ ST, I, 76, 1.

¹⁵ M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 814.

¹⁶ Joseph RATZINGER, *op.cit.*, 149-157.

J. Ratzinger concluded the principle features of the Christian faith in Eternal Life. *First*, the relationship between the souls with God from the creation and incarnation made them immortal, since God alone is the immortality. *Second*, the immortality of the soul flowered from the unity of both body and soul as the whole human being. Though after life soul seems “separated from the body,” actually from the beginning the whole man enters Eternal life. *Third*, the immortality of the soul deals with **the et-et bipolarity** of *both the individual soul and the others as the body of Christ*. Therefore, the soul together with his brothers and sisters, enters into the communion of saints and are drawn up to the dialogue to the Trinity through the Christ as the Head of the Body.¹⁷

Christ Will Come Again to Judge the Living and the Dead

THE RESURRECTION OF THE WHOLE BODY OF CHRIST

At this part, I shall discuss concerning the last days, resurrection of the dead, and the consummation of the world. Generally speaking, Christian faith does not only confess that God is *both love and merciful* (cf. 1 Jn 4), but at the same time, *Christ is eschatological judge who will judge all the living and the dead justly* (cf. Acts 10, 42; 1 Cor 4,4; 2 Tm 4,8; Heb 12, 23; Jas 4,12; 5,9). Here we found **the both-and principle**, that is *God’s merciful love and the all-powerful God*. This means after death the whole human being will be faced to a particular judgement (see my explanation about the “Intermediate State between Death and Resurrection”) and then the last judgement.¹⁸

In the last days, the soul will be reunited by the body. This will be called the Resurrection of the Body. This term is linked with some particular aspects of the resurrection of the dead. The classical theology described as the space and time of judgement days, the form of the risen body, and the book of life. Regarding with the place (Jl 4, 1-2) was understood as figurative sense as the judgement of the Lord. The time was interpreted as “the secret of the Father” (Acts 1,7). Dealing with the form of the risen body, there was still a process to a mature conception. At least, early Christianity assumed the risen body was similar to the earthly body but it did not need food and clothing. Then, the book of life (Phil 4,3; Rev

¹⁷ *Ibid.*, 157-160.

¹⁸ M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 825-826.

3,5; 13,8; 17,8; 20,11-15) explained the name of those who will be granted eternal salvation from God.¹⁹

According to Saint Thomas Aquinas the resurrection of the whole body of Christ can be reasonable in the light of paschal mystery.²⁰ We found in the doctrine of Angelic Doctor **the et-et bipolarity** as follows. As *Christ conquers both sin and at the end of the world, death*, so that the resurrection of the body is caused by the resurrection of Christ.²¹ The resurrection of the body does not contradict with the human nature. Indeed, the human soul causes the corporality of the human person. As he wrote: “*for the rational soul which is man’s form remains after death ... the matter, also, which was subject to such a form remains in the same dimensions which made it able to be the individual matter.*”²²

This also the explanation of **the both-and principle**, namely the unity of both body and soul by Saint Thomas Aquinas. There is no separation between body and soul. On the contrary, both of them become *a single unity and reality of the human person*. For this reason, the angelic doctor holds “*the composite of human body and soul*” as single reality of human person which last *until the end of life and to the end of times*. Through Saint Thomas Aquinas’ conception of human person, the eternal happiness in the future life can be actualized here and now by God alone. The limitedness of the unity both human soul and body in a single reality human person is accomplished by God himself.²³

THE PAROUSIA OF CHRIST AND THE LAST JUDGMENT

Speaking of the Parousia of Christ in the last days, it deals with the question of the signs of Christ’s return since the topic does not cover the history of human kind, but indeed, it is transcending the space and time. In this sense, the Parousia of Christ cannot cover the terms such place and even date. The solution for this matter is **the both-and principle**, that is going back to *the relation of Christology and Eschatology*. As Catholic faith confessed that Jesus Christ is truly God and fully man so that with the signs of Christ’ second coming. It penetrates *both in the history of human kind and the transcending act of God over the world*.

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, 834-836.

²⁰ M. L. LAMB, “The Eschatology of St. Thomas Aquinas”, in T. WEINANDY *et al* (eds.), *Aquinas on Doctrine: A Critical Introduction*, T & T Clark International, London 2004, 232.

²¹ *ST*, Suppl., 76, 1.

²² *Summa Contra Gentiles (ScG)*, IV, 78-79.

²³ M.L. LAMB, *op.cit.*, 233.

The sign of Christ's return in the history of the world is signified by war, catastrophe, and persecution of the faithful (*see* Mk 13). Furthermore, it concerns with the existence of antichrist (*see* 2 Thes 2, 3-10, 1 Jn 2, 18-22, 2 Jn 7, and Rev 13, 1-18). The term refers to the emperor of Roman as motive of persecution. In other hand, the sign of Christ's coming is finally revealed by God's transcending acts over the world, which is the power and love of God will conquer evil and death. It opens to the realistic Christian hope by the virtue of "readiness to expect" (cf. Mk 13, 37).²⁴

The sign of Parousia of Christ as stated, follows: "*Immediately after the tribulation of those days the sun will be darkened, and the moon will not give its light, and the stars will fall from heaven, and the powers of the heavens will be shaken*" (Mt 24, 29). Saint John Chrysostom gave comments on the following verse 30: "Then the sign of the Son of man will appear in heaven and then all the tribes of the earth will fight their breasts, and they will see the Son of man come on the clouds of the sky with great power and glory."²⁵

This meant the return of Christ finds its fulfillment in the celebration of the liturgy. Particularly, when the liturgy of Eucharist is celebrated by the Church and faithful, the *Parousia* of Christ always becomes a reality, fruitful, and so fully lived. The reality opens the future of Christ's return which is actualized here and now.²⁶ That is why the return of Christ echoed in the famous medieval hymn of *Dies irae*, the Holy Mass for the dead, and the Liturgy of the Hours. Even Thomas of Celano and a well-known classical music composer, W. A. Mozart composed *Requiem in D Minor* to attribute the eminence and divine splendor of Christ's return.²⁷

At the heart of Parousia of Christ is the Last Judgement. It mentioned when *Christ comes in His glory, He will judge all the living and the dead*. Here we found **the both-and bipolarity**. This explains the universal retribution. The word refers to the Christ as eschatological judgement who grants the reward of the Kingdom for the good and the eternal punishment for the evil one. At the time, Christ together with the angels and apostles, will judge all the living and the dead according their deeds while in the world.²⁸

Saint Thomas Aquinas profoundly elaborated Christ's judgement in the last days. All the people of God will be judge on all their works during

²⁴ Joseph RATZINGER, *op.cit.*, 194-201, 213-214.

²⁵ M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 829.

²⁶ Joseph RATZINGER, *op.cit.*, 201-204.

²⁷ M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 829-832.

²⁸ *Ibid.*, 827.

past, present, and future. The Angelic doctor considered four classes as follows. *First*, the wicked who will be condemned but not judged (namely, unbelievers). *Second*, the wicked who will be both condemned and judged (namely, the faithful who die in mortal sin). *Third*, the good who will be saved and will not judged (namely, those who for God's sake are poor in spirit). *Fourth*, the good who will be both saved and judged (namely, those who die in a state of righteousness). In order to prepare for the judgment, there are four remedies could be considered, that is good deeds, confession and repentance of the evil one, almsgiving, and charity.²⁹

THE HOPE OF THE NEW HEAVEN AND THE NEW EARTH

The last part of final judgement is “the hope of the new heaven and earth” (cf. Is 65,17; 2 Pt 3,13; Rev 21,1). Here we found **the et-et principle**, *that is the hope of the new heaven and earth*. This means the consummation of the world. The term refers to both the destruction and renewal. There will be elimination of the previous element of the earth or a remake of its splendor, and at the same time, there will be a *renewal of the world and universe*. In other words, there will be purification of the consequences of original sin toward the transformation of the whole world and the universe.³⁰

J. Ratzinger explained **the both-and bipolarity** of the hope of the new heaven and earth by the term a process of becoming. This term refers to *the process of both the material and spiritual world* becoming a unity. The unification *both matter and spirit* did not last in temporal world that we live in, but it will continuously reach *its goal and ultimate* completion until the end of time so that “God is all in all” (1 Cor 15, 28). Thus, the transformation of the world cannot be imagined because *it transcends all reality and transforms* to the new heaven and new earth.³¹ M. L. Lamb interpreted the new heaven and earth from Saint Thomas Aquinas' perspective:

The final state of the whole creation will find its glorious consummation in the ecstatic union of all the blessed with the Triune God, so that they will understand how their lives here on earth were conformed to the wisdom of Christ Jesus who redeemed us, not by removing evil through power, but by transforming evil

²⁹ SAINT THOMAS AQUINAS, *Aquinas Catechism: A Simple Explanation of the Catholic Faith by the Church's Greatest Theologian*, foreword by Ralph McInerney, Sophia Institute Press, Manchester, New Hampshire 2004, 63-69.

³⁰ M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 831-833.

³¹ Joseph RATZINGER, *op.cit.*, 191-194.

into good through his passion, death, and resurrection. The whole cosmos will be transfigured in the glorious presence of the whole Christ in whom each and every one of the blessed will be enraptured in communion with each other in the infinite understanding and love of the Triune God.³²

Purgatory, Heaven, and Hell

THE HELL AS ETERNAL PUNISHMENT AND DAMNATION

In this last part, we shall discuss the state of men between death and eternal life that is Hell, Purgatory, and Heaven. First of all, what is Hell? The teaching of Catholic Church stated that for those who committed mortal sin against *God, the neighbors, and themselves until the death*, those people are eternally separated from *the communion of God and the blessed*. After death, they will descent into Hell, which is *an eternal punishment and damnation, an everlasting suffering and eternal death*.³³ Here we found **the both-and principle** that state of the Hell as *Eternal Punishment and Damnation*, and also as *everlasting suffering and eternal death*.

The Church's tradition also called the state of hell as *the fire of Gehenna and darkness* (This is also **the both-and bipolarity**). The fire of Gehenna refers to anybody who revolt God's love without repenting when the death came. The darkness pointed out to the eternal damnation for the devil and his angels who definitely refused the goodness and God's love.³⁴ Thus, Hell is called a *penalty of damage and penalty of the sense*. This means, *the wicked and the damned will be punished and tortured in eternal fire*.³⁵ The fire of hell has character *metaphor and incorporeal*, the real fire which burned *all souls and evil spirit* in the Hell.³⁶

However, nowadays the dogma of Hell is still reserved but with many difficulties. Responding to this problematic, J. Ratzinger pointed out **the both-and principle** how the wicked are punished in Hell, this dealt with *historical freedom and eternal damnation*, and found its root in God's merciful love who respects human freedom. Thus, those who freely *refuse and separate* themselves from God's love will be destined to Hell, it is caused by human failure itself. Because of that, if we reflect deeply on the cross of Jesus Christ, He defeated *both evil and descended* into the Sheol.

³² M. L. LAMB, *op.cit.*, 237.

³³ CCC, 1033, 1035; M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 840.

³⁴ M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 837-840, CCC, 1034.

³⁵ *Ibid.*, 841-842.

³⁶ *ST*, Suppl., 70, 3.

He was entering His dark night of the soul. A term which applies the experience of the saints, such as Saint John of the Cross and Thérèse of Lisieux. At that time, *the presence of God's merciful love truly exists and at the same time "all dreadful reality of hell is no more denied."*³⁷ This is a very clear **the et-et principle** as regard with the Hell.

Therefore, M. Gagliardi encouraged us to look up hell as a positive reality and invitation for our Christian life. Once again, we listen to the Word of God and the Tradition of the Church that is to live out our life seriously by taking the right way, since the door to our salvation is "*the narrow door.*"³⁸ That is why the Catechism of Catholic Church invites us to penetrate the subject of Hell as *a call to responsibility and conversion*. Here the explanation of **the et-et bipolarity** of both a call to responsibility and conversion: "God predestines no one to go to Hell; for this, a willful turning away from mortal sin is necessary, and persistence in it until the end. In the Eucharistic liturgy and in the daily prayers of her faithful, the Church implores the mercy of God, who does not want 'any to perish, but all to come to repentance'" (2 Pet 3:9).³⁹

PURGATORY AS PURIFICATION AFTER DEATH AND PRIOR THE VISION OF GOD

As regard with the dogma of faith, that is so-called Purgatory, the International Theological Commission invited us to hinder all form of *carelessness* in a way of differentiating between Purgatory and Hell which caused great difficulties at the ecumenical dialog with Eastern Churches.⁴⁰ In a similar way, J. Ratzinger suggested a very good approach discussing Purgatory that was not from an effort of ecumenical reunions at Lyons (1274) and Florence (1439) because the article on the doctrine of purgatory had divided both churches.⁴¹ But through deepen understanding of the Council of Trent in the light of Scripture and Apostolic Tradition.

As the starting point, there was the prayer for the salvation of the dead who offended the law in Old Testament (*see 2 Mac 12, 38-45*). Here we found a rich **the et-et bipolarity** regarding Purgatory. On the Gospel of Matthew 5, 26, Cyprian of Carthage (d. 258) interpreted the text by indicating "the penitential way of purification exists *both in the world and in the world to come.*" Cyprian's analysis was developed by Clement of

³⁷ Joseph RATZINGER, *op.cit.*, 216-218.

³⁸ M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 842-844.

³⁹ CCC, 1037.

⁴⁰ International Theological Commission, 85.

⁴¹ Joseph RATZINGER, *op.cit.*, 219.

Alexandria. Through depth theological reflection on 1 Corinthians 3, 10-15 Clement of Alexandria stated purgatory as the “*purifying and educative power of this fire.*” In the West, Tertullian did not stress Purgatory as the prison or in modern term as “a Nazi concentration camp,” but it deals more with *the purification and process transformation toward beatific vision to God and the blessed.*⁴²

The development doctrine on Purgatory reached its maturity at the Council of Trent. In a reasonable way, the Council pointed out the reason why the souls need purification prior the beatific vision. The cause is the stains of the soul as *the impediment and darken* to the communion with God. The stains refer to *daily sins or venial sins and also “those remains of sin which may persist in the justified when guilt has been remitted and it attendant eternal punishment.”*⁴³ Here we found **the both-and bipolarity**, that is Purgatory as the purification after life and prior to meeting Christ in His glory. In the same way, purification is recognized as *both suffering and also joy* for the souls in Purgatory (here is also **the et-et bipolarity**). In one side, they will have joy for entering one day into the blessed heaven, but on the other side, they suffer in Purgatory. For that reason, Purgatory is the state belongs to an intermediate eschatological state.⁴⁴

After mentioning the state of Purgatory, the next question arises: what is the status of the souls in Purgatory? As recorded by Church’s tradition, there will be *a burning and purifying fire* in Purgatory. We found a rich **the et-et principle** regarding a burning and purifying fire in Purgatory as follows. As regard with the purgation fire, Saint John of the Cross described the Holy Spirit as “the living flame of love” that purifies the soul to reach the perfect love of God, *both on earth and which is necessary after death.*⁴⁵ For that reason, the burning fire of love explains *the temporal of punishment and suffering in purgatory.* We cannot predict how long the souls will last in purgatory since there is difference between our time and their time. That is the reason why, the Church invites us *pray for the dead and the souls in Purgatory* through our daily prayer, almsgiving, penance, indulgences, and especially in the sacrifice of mass *for the suffrages and our ancestors.* Through the Eucharist, the living can bring *respite and refreshment* to the souls in Purgatory. As a consequence,

⁴² Joseph RATZINGER, *op.cit.*, 224-225, 230-231; M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 845-847, 850.

⁴³ International Theological Commission, 83.

⁴⁴ M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 849-850, 854-855; International Theological Commission, 84.

⁴⁵ International Theological Commission, 85; M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 852-853.

for the living, it urges them to live in true repentance started *from avoiding venial sins and living according the right conscience.*⁴⁶

HEAVEN AS THE BEATIFIC VISION AND THE COMMUNION OF THE SAINTS

Finally, we arrive at last discussion, namely, Heaven. In this section, I found a very rich **the et-et bipolarity** on Heaven and Paradise. For those who died in *grace and friendship* with God, such as *the saints and the faithful* who died right after receiving baptism. Those perfectly purified before or after death with Christ, and *before receiving the risen body and general judgment*, they will enter into Heaven. Heaven refers to *the perfect and communion of life with Trinity*, to be with Christ, Mary, the angels and the blessed. In other words, *Heaven and paradise* signifies *divine light and eternal love*. In a very ineffable way, Heaven is *the ultimate end and the fulfillment of the deepest human longings*, as *the state of supreme and definitive happiness* could be reached by *Trinitarian of divine love and the mystery of Christ.*⁴⁷

M. Gagliardi pointed out **the et-et bipolarity** on biblical revelation regarding heaven. At the first place, Heaven was known as *the indwelling Heavenly Father (Ps 115,3) and its realization in the message of Jesus on the Kingdom of Heaven* especially in Matthew's Gospel. The second expression was the eternal life (Mt 7,14; Jn 4,14). Heaven is disclosed as the Heavenly Jerusalem, namely, the holy city from above which is *the indwelling of God and the elects* (Rev 3, 12; 21, 2.10). Finally, Heaven was stated as the perpetual light. It refers from the beginning that God is light who had light all creation through Christ, the Light of the world to *the eternal and endless light in heaven* (Gn 1, 1-5; Jn 8, 12; Rev 21, 23-5; 22, 3-5).⁴⁸

J. Ratzinger described **the both-and principle** that heaven as *the beatific vision and the communion of the saints*. It is necessary to define Heaven *in the mystery of Christ and the Church*. In the mystery of Christ, Jesus as truly God and fully man, so whole human existence was defined in the existence of God. Thus, heaven is not a utopia, but indeed, Heaven is a personal reality. Jesus by the virtue of death, resurrection, and ascension to the Heaven sits at the right hand of the Father. Jesus is the one who is in the Heaven. Jesus opens the way for all of us to Heaven. For this reason, Heaven becomes real and concrete for us. Our ascending to heaven

⁴⁶ M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 851-854; CCC, 1032; Joseph RATZINGER, *op.cit.*, 228.

⁴⁷ CCC, 1023-1023; M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 855.

⁴⁸ M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 856-859.

becomes possible through God's descending by the virtue of the Incarnation as the Gift of love. For that reason, we could infer all elements of tradition's concept regarding heaven. Heaven alone is the participation of human existence in *God's life and love*. Heaven is to be with God: Father, Son, and the Holy Spirit. This is so-called Beatific Vision.⁴⁹

M. Gagliardi added beatific vision is the eternal happiness to see God face to face as stated by Saint Paul: "*no eye has seen, nor ear heard, nor the heart of man conceived, what God has prepared for those who love him*" (1 Cor 2, 9). In this state, *the blessed and the elect* (here is **the et-et bipolarity**) will not only see the glorified human nature of Christ, but indeed, they will see the divine essence directly. Thus, in the heaven they will see God through *intellectual vision and by the light of glory* (this is also **the both-and bipolarity**).⁵⁰ Saint Thomas Aquinas synthesized what is called by Beatific Vision, "the vision of God is twofold. One is perfect which God's essence is seen. The other is imperfect, through which, although we do not see what God is, we still see what He is not; and in this life the more perfectly we know God, the more we understand him to exceed whatever is comprehended by the intellect."⁵¹

For that reason, the glory and the beatitude in the heaven is concretely anticipated by the reality of the Eucharist. At this paragraph, I found the elaboration of **the et-et principle** on the relation of both Heaven and the Eucharist. J. Ratzinger emphasized Heaven as the eschatological fulfillment of all believers is fulfilled by Christ Himself. Jesus Christ, through His Body and Blood, draws us to our final goal. Therefore, Eucharist indeed is *the foretaste and the seed of eternal life and the power of resurrection*.⁵² This reality brings us to the realism of ecclesiological aspect. The opening of Heaven by the exaltation of Christ, constitutes the communion of the whole body of Christ. Thus, Heaven is *both the personal aspect and the communion of the body of Christ*. Heaven is *both the Gift of God and the reward from God*. It is *realization and the fulfillment of the love of God and the love of neighbors*. Heaven is not only inside or outside our earthly life, but also power over the world that characterizes the new space of the Body of Christ, the communion of saints. Heaven is not above in a spatial but rather in an essential way. Though Heaven has not yet complete since all creation is still in process of coming to its completion by *the resurrection of the body and Parousia of Christ*. That is why heaven is

⁴⁹ Joseph RATZINGER, *op.cit.*, 239; M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 859, 868-869.

⁵⁰ M. GAGLIARDI, *op.cit.*, 860-866.

⁵¹ *ST*, II-II, q. 8, a. 7.

⁵² P. F. RYAN, "On Eschatology" in *Nova et Vetera*, vol. 15, no. 3, Steubenville 2017, 913.

seen as *the unity between God's original creation and the new heaven and the new earth.*⁵³

Conclusion

The discussion of eschatology departed from its basic understanding. It is started with God's salvation for all people who are actualized by human freedom. The metaphor of Old Testament finds its fulfillment in the reality of the New Testament. The reality is Jesus Christ who proclaims the Kingdom of God which is revealing the future life in the present days. Then, the criteria of Christology become the foundation of the eschatology's treatise.

The destiny of every human being after death disclosed the resurrection of Christ and our resurrection as a single reality. The Resurrection of Christ becomes the cause of our resurrection from the dead. Thus, this state is called the intermediate state. This state which refers to every single human being will go meet God. They will go immediately to Heaven, Purgatory, or Hell after a particular judgment. For this reason, it is necessary the re-understanding of the immortality of the soul. The formula "the soul as the form of the body" states the whole man from its historical and eternal life.

On the last days, the souls will be reunited with their bodies, namely, the risen bodies. After the resurrection of the dead, the glorified Christ will come to judge the living and the dead justly. That is so-called as Universal or Last Judgment. God will reward eternal life for the blessed and eternal punishment for the wicked and the damned. The treatise of eschatology is finalized with the Hell, Purgatory, and Heaven. Hell is the state for the wicked and the damned. Purgatory is intermediate state for purification after death and before the meeting with God in the Heaven. Heaven is the eternal communion with God and the saints.

⁵³ Joseph RATZINGER, *op.cit.*, 235-238; *Ibid.*, 913-914.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Catechism of the Catholic Church*, second edition, revised in accordance with the official Latin text promulgated by Pope John Paul II, Libreria Editrice Vaticana, Vatican City 2000.
- GAGLIARDI, M. *La Verità è Sintetica: Teologia Dogmatica Cattolica*, Cantagalli, Siena 2017.
- M. SHARKEY and T. WEINANDY (eds.), *International Theological Commission: Text and Documents 1986-2007*, vol. II., Ignatius Press, San Francisco 2009.
- RATZINGER, Joseph (Pope Benedict XVI), *Eschatology: Death and Eternal Life*, second edition, translated by M. WALDSTEIN and edited by A. NICHOLS, The Catholic University of America Press, Washington, D.C. 1988.
- SAINT THOMAS AQUINAS, *Aquinas Catechism: A Simple Explanation of the Catholic Faith by the Church's Greatest Theologian*, foreword by Ralph McInerney, Sophia Institute Press, Manchester, New Hampshire (NH) 2004.
- _____, *Summa Contra Gentiles, Book Four: Salvation*, translated with an Introduction and Notes by Charles J. O'NEIL, Image Books, New York (NY) 1957.
- _____, *Summa Theologica*, translated by Fathers of English Dominican Province, Kindle Editions 2013.
- WALLS, Jerry L. (ed.), *The Oxford Handbook of Eschatology*, Oxford University Press, New York (NY) 2008.
- WEINANDY, T. *et al* (eds.), *Aquinas on Doctrine: A Critical Introduction*, T & T Clark International, London 2004.
- Nova et Vetera*, The English Edition of the International Theological Journal, vol. 15, no. 3, Steubenville 2017, 913.